

Multiculturalism in Paradise: Emerging Ethnicity, Religion, Belief and Tourism in Bali

By

I Gusti Ngurah Jayanti

Centre for Environmental Archaeological Research, Maritime and Sustainable Culture-BRIN, Indonesia

Email: igus019@brin.go.id

I Wayan Rupa

Research Centre for Religious Treasures and Civilization-BRIN, Indonesia

Email: iway024@brin.go.id

I Made Satyananda

Research Centre for Religious Treasures and Civilization-BRIN, Indonesia

Email: satyaimade@yahoo.co.id

I Wayan Sudarma

Research Centre for Religious Treasures and Civilization-BRIN, Indonesia

Email: wayansudarma59@gmail.com

I Made Suarsana

Research Centre for Religious Treasures and Civilization-BRIN, Indonesia

Email: imad021@brin.go.id

I Wayan Ardika

Association of Indonesian Archaeologists, Indonesia

Email: ardika52@yahoo.co.id

I Nengah Subadra

University of Triatma Mulya, Bali, Indonesia

Email: inengahsubadra@gmail.com

Abstract

This study is aimed at understanding multicultural practises in worshipping sites and investigating the establishments of social cohesion and inter-ethnic connectivity in fostering religious harmony in Bali. It adopted a qualitative method and used primary data collected through observation, interviews, documentation, and secondary data obtained from literature studies. The data were analysed thematically according to the purposes of the research. This research finds multicultural worship practises have been implemented since the 9th century, which could be seen in the traditions and symbols used in Hindu worship sites in Bali. The worshipping practises involving people of different ethnicities and religions in the worshipping sites remain existed and they support each other and live a peaceful and harmonious life in Bali. The value of multiculturalism introduced by the ancestors is currently practised and serves as a moral foundation for fostering religious harmony and supporting the development of cultural tourism in Bali. This openness to diversity has allowed Bali to become a hub for global tourists seeking spiritual experiences and cultural exchange wherein they can observe and participate in Balinese rituals, contributing to the preservation of their unique cultural heritage.

Keywords: multiculturalism, worshipping sites, ethnic, diversity, cultural tourism

ARTICLE HISTORY
Received 9 January 2023
Accepted 22 April 2023

Introduction

Multiculturalism is the existence of many different cultural groups in one nation. Understanding and valuing these distinctions is crucial because it promotes the development of a robust society. This is why multiculturalism is a topic that is frequently discussed, especially as it concerns various groups of people in various nations. It is important to understand and appreciate these differences because it helps to build a strong society. This is why there is a lot of discussion about multiculturalism, especially as it relates to different groups of people in different countries. There are two different ways that people might look at multiculturalism. One approach is based on academic research and looks at multiculturalism as a problem of the many different cultural groups living in a country. The other approach is based on people's own cultural experiences, which focus on the ways that these different cultures interact. While the academic approach strives for understanding and respect, the cultural experience perspective prioritizes personal connections and empathy between individuals. Balancing both approaches can create a more inclusive and tolerant multicultural society. Ultimately, a blend of research and empathy can help bridge the gap between different cultural groups.

This study focuses on the multiculturalism in Bali, especially how worship practices and historical background can be built so that social cohesion can be built and inter-ethnic interactions, as well as beliefs, can go together without overwhelming each other and even bring peace missions through tourism. The research aims to explore the role of tourism in promoting cultural understanding and tolerance among different ethnic groups in Bali. It also seeks to identify potential challenges and opportunities for promoting intercultural dialogue and cooperation in the context of Bali's multicultural society. Multiculturalism means that there are many different cultures in a society, and everyone is allowed to live and practice their own culture.

The occurrence of pluralism and cultural pluralism in Bali cannot be separated from the long history of human mobility and migration, especially in trading activities in ancient times. One of the factors that can be used as a cause is the movement or distribution of people who come to visit either with trade interests or an expansion of power in control or territory, which has an impact on meetings and interactions that bring about a mix of ethnic, cultural, and technological developments at that time. These interactions and developments can lead to the emergence of new societies and civilizations, as well as the spread of ideas, technologies, and cultural practices. Therefore, the movement of people can be a significant factor in shaping the course of human history. This mix of cultures and traditions has contributed to the unique and diverse cultural landscape of Bali, which is evident in its architecture, arts, music, and religious practices. Today, Bali remains a hub for cultural exchange and attracts tourists from all over the world who come to experience its rich cultural heritage. Bali's cultural landscape is not only diverse but also dynamic, with new forms of expression emerging alongside traditional ones. This makes Bali a fascinating destination for those interested in exploring the intersection of tradition and modernity.

Multiculturalism And Its Significance To Peaceful Society And Tourism

The concept of multiculturalism was introduced to the public sphere during the late 1960s and early 1970s, when Australia and Canada publicly endorsed it. The decision of these nations to embrace a multicultural identity and publicly express their support for it during this era offers valuable insight into the significance of these terms (Rattansi, 2011). Multiculturalism denotes the acquisition and application of knowledge from diverse cultures, as well as the utilization of multiple cultural frameworks to navigate societal interactions (Hong and Khei, 2014). The term multicultural self pertains to an individual's interpretation of the impact of multicultural influences on their sense of self and identity. Multiculturalism is a way of thinking that is focused on understanding different cultures and how they work together (Aydin, 2014). Hong and Khei (2014) argue that multicultural society is made up of people who have different backgrounds or have lived in different places and have experienced different cultures. This means that they have different skin colours, come from different countries, or have parents from different places. In other words, multiculturalism means making sure everyone who comes from a different country or culture is treated fairly and has the same opportunities (Rattansi, 2011; Aydin, 2014). Multicultural individuals often have a unique perspective on the world and can bring diverse ideas and experiences. Embracing multiculturalism can lead to a more inclusive and accepting society. It is related to the idea of western cultural hegemony, which is when the west controls and dominates other cultures.

This cultural influence has led to the development of orientalism, which is a way of thinking that is based on ontological and epistemological distinctions between "East" and "West" (Koefoed and Haldrup, 2020). These distinctions have led philosophers to continue to search for meaning and to critique what was discussed by the west toward the east. They generally conclude that "Western" identity, which is based on rationality, linearity, and secularity, is nothing more than a text. Texts have been woven with threads of power over discourses about the irrational, circular, and spiritual "East." The east has never been allowed to define itself uniquely without referring to the western frame of reference (Adian, 2002). The concept of multiculturalism has become important in re-evaluating the east and redefining culture without having to standardize it from Western culture. Moreover, multicultural self-awareness is an essential component of multicultural competence, which involves the ability to understand and appreciate cultural differences and effectively communicate with individuals from diverse backgrounds (Hong and Khei, 2014). This has led to a greater appreciation of the diversity of the East and the unique contributions it has made to human civilization. Multiculturalism has also opened up new opportunities for cross-cultural dialogue and understanding.

The focus of multicultural studies is not on how one group differs from another or how unusual or distinctive each tradition is; rather, it is on how various groups interact with one another in the same space. BankierKarp (2022) found that connectedness among worshippers upon the space played great roles in sharing a certain religious space with others and the level of engagements depending on the belief background. This highlights the importance of physical space in facilitating religious practices and interactions. However, further research is necessary to fully understand the relationship between spatial connectedness and religious engagement. Additionally, friendship has also contributed to the notion of multiculturalism in religious activities and affiliations where they share the same site (Simsek et al., 2021). They do use the same site, but they practice their own religious rites, which consequently result in different experiences and religious values (Kollar and Fleischmann, 2022). While pluralism denotes diversity within a single ethnicity or nation within a single entity, multiculturalism denotes diversity between ethnicities, nations, or ethnic groups (Putra, 2008). The concepts of diversity

and multiculturalism can be seen as the range of cultural practices present in social interactions where mutual respect and respect for other cultural communities develop. It appears that discussing different cultures reinforces the view of culture as a fixed entity that has a direct impact on an individual's behaviour. Kimanen (2018) believes that the increasing diversity of cultural practices in open societies makes it more important for local people to be able to adapt their religious practices in a way that is inclusive for everyone. This means that rather than assuming that a particular culture has a uniform set of beliefs and practices, it is important to recognize the diversity within those communities and their ability to adapt to different situations. This may lead to greater understanding, tolerance, and inclusivity, especially in increasingly diverse societies.

Furthermore, Koentjaraningrat (1990) argues that the migration of human groups on earth also contributed to the spread of cultural and historical elements in what is often called the diffusion process. The case of Bali for instance, the migration and mobility of the population for various interests, both trade and expansion of power in ancient times as well as tourism, had an impact on the configuration and differentiation of the Balinese people. In other words, interactions between ethnic groups within the island for the purposes of trading and traveling have now also been used to exchange or adopt cultural elements and share them with other ethnic groups (Collins-Kreiner et al., 2013; Subadra, 2015). This is partly due to the dynamic of Balinese culture, which accepts other cultures and formulates the newly coined term "cultural commodification," which is currently learned and discussed in academic debates from cultural and tourism perspectives (Picard, 2008; Subadra, 2015; Ardika and Subadra, 2018).

Putra & Hitchcock (2007) and Subadra (2015) relate worshipping sites and tourism, wherein temple sites, which are primarily used for worshipping by Hindus in Bali, are contested by tourists who search for pleasure and learning Balinese culture. The designations of Hindu temples as tourism sites remain debateable among the tourism scholars, especially when looking at the interactions between the local people and tourists in the worshipping sites, which are sometimes harmonious and can also be conflicting. To some extent, the secularization of sacred worshipping sites for tourism has aided the preservation of the temple spiritually and physically, but it has also raised conflicts among the stakeholders contesting the sites since they have different perspectives on and interests in the site (Subadra, 2015; Ardika and Subadra, 2018; Vermeer and Scheepers, 2021). At this point, it is clear that secularism does not only cause negative aspects such as conflicts and resistance, but it also encompasses a wide range of other aspects relevant to the organization of life in society, such as religious freedom, tolerance, neutrality, and equality (Sommier, 2018). The use of sacred sites for tourism has both positive and negative consequences. While it aids in physical and spiritual preservation, conflicting interests among stakeholders can cause disputes. Despite this, it is important to recognize that secularism has broader implications, including religious freedom, tolerance, neutrality, and equality.

Various cultural events and interactions as well as cultural acculturation from various places met and exchanged not only physically but biologically and technologically, which became the roots of the growth and development of multiculturalism in Bali. The social box occurs through trade routes, especially at ports in the northern part of the island of Bali, which served as the main entrance for traders, explorers, and tourists (Subadra, 2015). Bali's multiculturalism is also influenced by outside forces such as colonialism and globalization through media and tourism. These external factors have accelerated the circulation and exchange of various cultures in Bali. Moreover, Arta (2019) states that geographically, North Bali is very strategic, so trade contacts between Bali and Java are more intensive in the area of

North Bali. In addition, the sea conditions in the northern part are relatively conducive for the journey of boats using a simple navigation technology system. This can be shown by the existence of natural ports in the northern coastal region such as Sangsit, Buleleng, Temukus, Gilimanuk, Pangkuk, Tanjung Ser, Pacung, and Semiran. All of these existing ports are the entrances and ancient trade routes in North Bali that connect them with other areas in the archipelago prior to and after Dutch occupation (Subadra, 2015). These ports not only facilitated trade but also played a significant role in the exchange of culture and ideas. Historical records and artifacts found in these areas attest to the vibrant maritime activities that once flourished in North Bali.

Archaeological evidence showing the movement of people from various regions who came to the island of Bali can be seen from evidence of remains, such as the discovery of Indian pottery in Sembiran and Pacung, where the pottery has a decorative roulette pattern originating from Arikamendu, South India (Ardika, 2004). The movement of human mobility from various places, such as India, China, and the Southeast Asian Region in general, through foreign trade, can be obtained from information in ancient Balinese inscriptions, including the Bebetin AI inscription (896 AD), Sembiran B (951 AD), and Sembiran AII (975 AD). The terms used in the inscription are *banyaga* (traders who sail the seas) and *banirama* (merchant association) (Ardika, 2004). As Musa (2009) notes, the plurality of Bali is an empirical reality that should be accepted since there is no homogeneous society in terms of inter-ethnic relations in the archipelago. Therefore, the study of multi-ethnic and multicultural societies in Bali is needed to understand their existence.

Multiculturalism in Bali has continued to occur more intensively since the reign of the kingdom of the descendant of the Majapahit King in Gelgel in the 14th century. At that time, Javanese people who were Muslims came to Bali. Moreover, during the reign of Dalem Ketut Ngulesir (1380–1460), the king of Bali had come to Java (Majapahit) in the context of political relations between Bali and Majapahit. Hence, when he returned from Majapahit with a group of 40 Javanese who had embraced the religion of Islam and arrived in Bali, the king gave him a place to live in Gelgel, which is now called the village of Gelgel. The Muslims were loyal to the king's rule and brought their own culture and coexistence with the Hindu community. Furthermore, during the reign of Dalem Waturenggong (1460–1550), a messenger from the King of Demak (Raden Fatah), who wanted to introduce Islam to Bali, arrived. However, this attempt failed because King Gelgel did not want to accept Islam. As a result, the Balinese people continued to practice their Hindu-Buddhist beliefs, which were deeply rooted in their culture and tradition. This rejection led to the rise of a syncretic religion in Bali that combined elements of Hinduism and Islam. This religion is known as Bali's unique form of Islam, which is still practiced by a minority of Balinese Muslims today.

Additionally, around the 16th century, Javanese Muslims also came to Buleleng. The Javanese king of Surakarta brought a gift of an elephant from Surakarta, Java, to King I Gusti Ngurah Pandji Sakti (circa 1587) as a sign of friendship. The envoy was given a place around the palace, which is nowadays known as Banjar Jawa. The descendants of the Javanese people were given the task of clearing the forest in Pegatepan; hereinafter, this area was called Pegayaman (Dhurorudin, 2014). In the same vein, Ardana (2012) and Dhurorudin (2014) claim that Bali has long been formed by the process of migration from various ethnic groups to various regions. They now have an important role in the political, trade, and cultural aspects. The diaspora of various ethnic groups still has strong cultural ties with their places of origin, namely Java, South Sulawesi, Minang (West Sumatra), Lombok, and Timor, and has high social ties and kinship among them. Multicultural society in Bali has existed since earlier times, so it has become an inseparable part of various sectors of life. This cultural connectedness has

been maintained through shared customs, religious practices, and language, as well as frequent visits and financial support to their homeland. Despite living in different regions around the world, these diaspora communities take pride in their cultural heritage and actively strive to preserve and promote it.

Historical evidence shows that various aspects of culture, including Islam, Christianity, and Buddhism, currently exist in Bali and have initiated the rise of pilgrimage on the island, wherein people visit such sites for the purposes of religious and tourism delights (Collins-Kreiner, 2009; Subadra, 2015; Soljan et al., 2023; Huang et al., 2023). Obviously, religious pluralism provides opportunities for people to learn about different cultures and religions in depth to enhance their knowledge and develop their sense of universalism, which respects others, through tourism (Subadra, 2022). In other words, tourism has great roles in promoting peace and universalism within the multicultural community that is framed by a particular tourism destination. Additionally, religious tourism can also boost the economy of the area by creating jobs for the community and increasing revenue for businesses. It helps to preserve historical and cultural sites, ensuring their continuation for future generations to learn from and appreciate.

Furthermore, the Balinese attitude of tolerance and high appreciation for the existence of Islam is also found in the building complex of a temple in Bunutin Village, Bangli. This temple is known as Pura Langgar or Pura Dalem Jawa. Within this temple complex, there are not only a number of sacred buildings for Hindus but also a Langgar building, which functions as a place of worship for Muslims. Pura Langgar was built in the XVII century by the Puri Bunutin family as a tribute to one of their ancestors who embraced Islam (Pujastawa, 2012). Similarly, in the centre of Denpasar City there is the Raden Ayu Siti Kodijah Sacred Cemetery, named for a family descended from the Denpasar Pemecutan Palace that was married by a Madurese aristocrat and is now visited by two people (Muslim and Hindu) and continues to this day (Ngurah, 2010).

Another evidence of great Balinese acceptance of plurality is the income of Chinese, who also bring their cultures and traditions. As a result, Chinese culture also influences Balinese culture, namely with historical evidence of the entry of ethnic Chinese in Bali. Elements of Chinese culture entered Bali through trade routes. Trade at that time was in the hands of the Chinese and the Bugis. They come in small boats and anchor in south Bali ports such as Kuta, which has two ports, namely the east coast and west coast, or in north Bali ports such as Buleleng, Sangsit, and Temukus. The Chinese trade has fulfilled some of the needs of the Balinese people. The commodities that were sold at that time were opium, gambier, textiles, kepeng, iron, gunpowder, and firearms (Agung, 1989). The more intensive the relations with the Chinese, the more the kings of Bali gradually made social contacts and cooperated with the Chinese regarding trade. Balinese kings considered the Chinese to have skills in managing trade, so they gave them trust and the right to collect excise at the ports in the king's territory. Reciprocal (reciprocal) trade relations between Chinese people both in society and in rulers (kings) strengthened social cohesion not only in economic practice but also in the realm of ideology, namely the belief in religious practices that respect each other. This can be seen in the religious practice of one holy place: two beliefs between Confucianism (Buddhist) and Hinduism can now be seen at Batur Temple, a place of worship for Hindus in Bali (Ardika, 2017; Suarjaya, 2012). Contemporarily, the tight bond between Balinese and Chinese cultures has now been served as a special tourism attraction at the Bali Safari Tourism, which stages a cultural drama show with cultural ecosystem value to enrich tourists' experiences traveling to Bali, "the endless rites island," where rituals can be seen anytime of the day and anywhere on the island (Subadra, 2022).

This existence reflects that the Balinese as a religious society are able to coexist peacefully with various ethnic groups, religions, and races as well as various mindsets and identities since they share the outstanding value embedded in the cultural ecosystem service (Idoko, 2022; Subadra, 2022). The strategic issue resulting from this research is that society as a whole knows more deeply that plurality in Bali is an undeniable reality, as implied in the motto Bhineka Tunggal Ika, and that Hindus in Bali are able to anticipate various plural issues that can disrupt the integrity of the nation and state. In an effort to strengthen the understanding of diversity in the multiculturalism paradigm, in order to build a large Indonesian nation with a very plural society going forward, Bhinneka Tunggal Ika must be interpreted differently in terms of unity, not uniting differences (Aliffiati, 2012). Bhinneka Tunggal Ika is the foundation of the state to build a plural nation with the recognition of community groups that have different racial, ethnic, cultural, and religious backgrounds (Kumbara and Sutrisno, 2012). Recognizing the importance of awareness of these differences, Balinese people are even now still able to coexist peacefully. This principle promotes unity and tolerance, allowing Indonesia to embrace diversity and uphold harmony despite differences. It serves as a reminder for Indonesians to respect and appreciate one another's unique identities and cultures.

Research Method

This study applied a qualitative method that produces descriptions in the form of written or spoken words of people and observable behaviour and aimed at understanding social phenomena that existed within worshipping sites in Bali (Denzin and Lincoln, 2018; Subadra, 2019a). The research was undertaken in active worshipping sites located in four regencies of Bali, including Buleleng, Bangli, Karangasem, and Denpasar, to observe how the local communities sustain multicultural worshipping sites as part of their devotions to almighty God and how outsiders contest the site for different purposes. The data collection was conducted through semi-structured interviews using interview questions (Yin, 2018). The informants were selected using specific criteria that correspond to the research objectives and have a level of knowledge on the cases being studied, including: having a general understanding and insight regarding religion in particular and the cultural customs of the ethnic groups (Hinduism, Islam, Christianity, and Buddhism), and being actively involved in worshipping and organizing ceremonies. A number of face-to-face interviews were conducted with public figures, temple priests, religious leaders, administrative village chiefs, traditional village chiefs, and cultural experts to gain more comprehensive primary data (Denzin and Lincoln, 2018; Subadra, 2019a). Thematic analysis was used to group and analyse the interview recordings, which were triangulated in accordance with the research questions (Fereday and Muir-Cochrane, 2006; Yin, 2018). In addition, village monographs, traditional village scrips, and related academic articles were also consulted as secondary data to enrich the varieties of the data and obtain a more in-depth understanding of the case studied (Yin, 2018; Subadra, 2019a).

Finding And Discussion

Religious practices and social cohesion of multicultural societies in Bali

The interaction of social groups has been built for a long time since the island of Bali became a place for visits by various ethnic groups or nations, where they carry out trading activities. Since the archipelago has become a strategic route in international trade. Bali, since the 8th century AD, has carried out the context of nations, especially related to trade. The movement of people or mobility to various places such as Bali by ethnic groups such as Bajo, Bugis, Javanese, and other nations such as Chinese, Portuguese, British, and Dutch will have a broad impact in the future. Interaction and diffusion processes have occurred as a result of

social relations that have been strengthened by religious practices that occur in several temples in Bali, which will be further discussed in the following headings on multiculturalism found in four regencies or cities in Bali, including Buleleng, Bangli, Karangasem, and Denpasar. These unique social relationships have contributed to the development and preservation of traditional customs, arts, and festivals in these regions. Consequently, the local culture in Bali remains exciting and deeply rooted in its people's ways of life.

Sharing Worshipping Site between Balinese and Chinese as a Multiculturalism Evidence in Buleleng Regency

The Pabean Temple is located on the coast of Banyupoh Village, Gerokgrak District, approximately 120 km from Denpasar city. The name Pura Pabean refers to the name of the 'customs' institution that regulates, supervises, and collects entry and exit fees for foreign ships and trading commodities both by land and by sea (Sudiana & Nuriawan, 2022). This temple was built on the basis of two different religions, namely Hinduism and Confucianism. In accordance with the view of experts that ethnic Chinese may also be non-Balinese ethnicities controlling ports and trade in Bali (Geertz, 2000; Pringle, 2004; Schaublin & Brigitta Hauser, 2014; & Margi, 2013), The development of shrines to glorify these traders formed relations with foreign traders (Mecca, Chinese, and Siamese) and those outside Bali (Malaysians, Madurese, and Sundanese). The Pabenan Pulaki Temple is a symbol and, at the same time, evidence of a harmonious relationship between the Balinese and the Chinese people. Even now, this relationship is still intertwined, as can be seen from the worship practices that take place at the Pabean temple. The temple is visited by both Balinese and Chinese worshippers, who pray together, a testament to the shared religious and cultural values they hold. Over the years, the temple's sanctity has helped to maintain the peaceful coexistence of these two communities.

The Pabean Temple was built around the 15th century and is associated with Dang Hyang Nirartha's journey from East Java (Blambangan) to Bali (Dalem Gelgel), which is thought to have occurred during the reign of Dalem Cri Waturenggong (Sudiana & Nuriawan, 2022). Ida Bagus Tugur was the architect who designed the restoration of the Pabean Temple around 1995. Then, in 1996, a temporary transfer ceremony of Ida Batara Pabean was held on the south side during the renovation of the temple. Then a small-scale spiritual inauguration ceremony was carried out in 1999, as well as a large-scale complete ceremony that was held on November 19, 2002, at the fifth full moon, which coincided with Penampahan Galungan—a day before the Hindu victory day. The raw material for black stone is used throughout the architecture (Sudiana & Nuriawan, 2022).

The multicultural aspects that can be seen at the Pabean temple include the fact that the worshippers who pray at this temple are not only Hindus living near the temple but also Hindus living throughout the island, as well as Buddhists who have a spiritual bond with the temple that they inherited from their ancestors. Apart from joint prayer, multiculturalism is also reflected in the existence of shrines at the Pabean temple, including Pelinggih Padmasana, Ratu Anglurah, Ida Ratu Syahbandar, Dewi Ayu Manik Mas, Dewi Kwam Im, Anglurah Polos, Lingga Ida Bhatara Mpu Kuturan, Lingga Ida Hyang Baruna, Great Deeds, and Bale Kulkul, some dedicated to Hindu Gods and Goddesses, and others to Buddhist Gods. The uniqueness of the Pabean Temple is marked by the presence of the Padmasana media, the Hindu monument, and the Kong Hu Chu media temple. These two monuments of worship stand parallel as a symbol of multiculturalism in a harmony between Hindu and Buddhist. Visitors to the Pabean Temple can appreciate the distinctiveness of the site through its coexistence of Hindu and Buddhist elements. Pabean Temple's representation of religious harmony through different monuments is proof of Indonesia's multicultural roots. The co-existence of Padmasana

and Kong Hu Chu media temples showcases how religion can bring communities together while respecting unique beliefs.

Multiculturalism, which first appeared among the worshipers of the Pabean Temple, is very visible in various religious and social activities, such as mutual cooperation in repairing temples and practicing joint prayer ceremonies. Additionally, it can also be found in shrine and temple architecture, which is a combination of Malay, Chinese, Hindu, Islamic, and Balinese architecture. The forms and universal values that have multicultural values contained in the Pabean Temple have the potential to integrate multicultural values, making society have multicultural characteristics. Multiculturalism in the Pabean temple was initiated by trade relations between the local/Balinese community and foreign traders, which eventually gave birth to values of harmony, harmony, and mutual respect between different ethnicities.

This multicultural relationship links and connects with the existence of the Pegonjongan temple as the Segara temple located in Tejakula, Buleleng, where the ancient port used to become trading ports in the east during the ancient Balinese era. The position became important with other Segara temples because the son of a Chinese trading port named Kang Cing Wie in Pagonjongan was married to the King of Bali Aga, named Jayapangus. This marital relationship strengthens ties not only in trade but also in social and religious relations. Sea trade became very advanced because Ratu Syahbandar was in Puja, in the coastal area, and was in every trading port. The blend of Hinduism and Buddhism became very strong in North Bali and in the ancient Balinese villages in North Bali (Pageh & Rai, 2014). The Chinese princess Kang Cing Wei had a central role in the Jaya Pangus leadership, especially in trade. Kang Cing Wei became a unifier and liaison between ethnic nations that traded in Bali. The Chinese princess can be seen in her inheritance until now, in the construction of a joint temple, called the Gambur Anglayang temple, also known as the Kertanegara temple, which is now located in Kubuplus Buleleng, as a unifier for traders from various ethnic nations who traded in North Bali, including the Queen of Mecca, Queen Sudawan, Ratu Ayu Syah Subandar, and Dalem Pingit. Almost all ancient ports are equipped with a Syahbandar Temple as a place of worship for Ratu Ayu Mas Subandar, who controls trade (Arta, 2019).

Another temple that is also related to trade is the Ponjok Batu temple in Tejakula District, Buleleng. Of the many pelinggih found at Ponjok Batu Temple, one of them has a uniqueness that uses Chinese ornaments (Thonghoa), where there are decorations such as lanterns, lion statues, and incense burners. This shrine is named Ratu Bagus Mas Subandar (Picture 1). Ratu Mas Subandar shrine is a place of worship not only for ethnic Chinese, who are Buddhists, but also for ethnic Balinese, who are Hindus, at Ponjok Batu Temple (Wahyuni, 2021). The relatedness of trade relations, which is reflected in the symbol of worship of Ratu Ayu Mas Subandar (female) and Ratu Bagus Mas Subandar (male), is also a symbolic alignment in terms of gender. This concept is of course also familiar to Bali between the lingga and yoni and the representations of male and female. This cult concept has provided a unifying force between ethnicities for harmonization and strengthening or bonding of relations to achieve multiculturalism in its day and became the foundation for building a sustainable life.

Picture 1: *Ratu Bagus Mas Subandar*



Source: *Field Research, 2023*

In addition to those temples, Negara Gambur Anglayang Temple also shows practice of multiculturalism. It is located in Kubudindingan Village, Buleleng Regency. There are a variety of sacred buildings to worship, including Ratu Bagus Sundawan from Sundanese elements, Pelinggih Ratu Bagus Melayu from elements of the Malay race, Ratu Ayu Syahbandar and Ratu Manik Mas showing Chinese or Buddhist elements, Pelinggih Ratu Pasek, Dewi Sri, and Ratu Gede Shiva which reflect elements of Hinduism, and the most unique pelinggih is Ratu Gede Dalem Mecca, which shows elements of Islam. The existence of this pelinggih in the Negara Gambur Anglayang Temple shows tolerance towards Islam and other ethnicities in Kubudindingan. The presence of various ethnic and religious worship areas in one temple area indicates that social contact between local people and immigrants, in this case, traders from various ethnicities, can be beneficial and help to share knowledge and cultural elements. This type of contact between different groups of people helps to create a sense of cooperation and mutual respect, which in turn leads to increased trade and commerce in the area.

The port area known as Kuta Banding is a busy place where many traders from outside come. It is also said that the Negara Gambur Anglayang Temple was originally a trading center surrounded by a fortress called Kuta Banding (the war fortress), where all traders from different ethnic, racial, and religious backgrounds could gather. This temple is a symbol of religion and is believed to be a human goal. Various people of different faiths and beliefs have built it over the years, demonstrating their belief in it. This is in accordance with the opinion that the Negara Gambur Anglayang Temple is a multicultural temple that contains values of tolerance and solidarity between religious communities. It is also felt as a religious social act that is able to deliver people of different religions to absorb and live the peace of life in diversity.

Multiculturalism and Tourism at Ulun Danu Batur Temple in Bangli Regency

Ulun Danu Batur Temple is located in Batur Village, Kintamani, Bangli Regency. Ulun Danu Batur Temple is a public temple that is worshipped by Hindus in Bali. Within this temple complex, there is also the shrine of Ratu Gede Ngurah Subandar, which is worshipped by Buddhists. The continuity of this tradition is indeed a tradition inherited from the ancestors, which until now is still intensely revered by Hindus. In their daily lives, they constantly make spiritual pilgrimages; both Hindus in Bali and Buddhists from outside Bali come to the temple to pray, which in essence is to ask for safety and wish for success in business and trade. Interestingly, there are also shrines at Ulun Danu Batur Temple that are worshipped by Muslims, such as the shrines of Ratu Dalem Madura, Ratu Dalem Layar, Ratu Dalem Mecca, and Ratu Dalem Masiem Worship. This cult is closely related to the past history of meetings and the social context of the local people towards migrants from outside Bali through trade and political power relations in their time.

The social relationship between the Chinese and local Balinese rulers is evident in the economic field, especially trade. Many Chinese people become officials and have the authority to collect customs at the local ports in Bali. They are often called Sahbandar or Subandar. The word Subandar comes from syahbandar, namely the ruler of the port (Geertz, 2000; Schaublin & Brigitta Hauser, 2014). During pre-colonial and colonial times, the Chinese group played an important role in relation to trade and business in Bali and Lombok. According to Van Eck (Schaublin & Brigitta Hauser, 2014), the Chinese lived in the port of Buleleng, North Bali, in 1848. A syahbandar named Pondad, as a captain, had access to the king and the palace. The king trusted Subandar with the power to control the port, including export and import goods as well as taxes. Geertz (2000) also stated that almost all the small kings in Bali each had a Chinese person. The Chinese were given the highest office, sometimes honored as Subandar (syahbandar), trade lord, and had a complete monopoly; a protector regulated all other foreign trade in a syndicate centred on himself. Export goods include rice (36%), coffee (13%), tobacco (12%), soybeans (11%), livestock (cattle, pigs, 9%), and the remainder is coconut and cotton. Imported commodities include opium (87%) and cotton cloth (6%) (Geertz, 2000; Pringle, 2004). As port officials (subandar), the Chinese always maintained close relations. When the king needed various things, such as for religious ceremonies, Subandar gave goods and gifts to the king, including silk and Chinese wives and daughters. Subandar was also allowed to marry Balinese women. It is interesting to note the gifts of Chinese princesses to Balinese kings. In the myth of King Jayapangus, who married a Chinese princess, Kang Cing Wei was the daughter of I Subandar, a Chinese trader selling at the Kintamani market (Argawa, 2018).

The existence of Ratu Subandar's shrine in Ulun Danu Batur Temple appears to be connected to Subandar's strength and influence in Kintamani, as can be seen from the facts provided above. According to archaeological data, there was a connection between the Kintamani region and the port of Julah on the north Bali coast during the Ancient Bali period (Ardika, 2022). Ratu Subandar's shrine at Ulun Danu Batur Temple appears to be linked to the role of Chinese and Subandar foreign traders in Kintamani. In addition to the shrine of Ratu Subandar, there are a number of shrines for foreign traders in the Ulun Danu Batur temple complex, including the Ratu Dalem Majapahit/Ratu Dalem Madura, Ratu Dalem Layar (Indian traders), Ratu Dalem Mecca (Arabic), and Ratu Dalem Mesiam (Siam) (Schaublin & Brigitta Hauser, 2014). All of these shrines are associated with Muslim traders, and at Ulun Danu Batur Temple, the offerings are made without the use of pork. The presence of these shrines in the temple complex reflects the history of foreign traders in Bali and the influence of Islam in the region. It is interesting to note that despite the association with Islam, the offerings made at these shrines do not include pork, as it is not permissible in the halal diet.

There are some differences between the way the Chinese community participates in religious ceremonies at Ratu Subandar and on Chinese New Year holidays. For example, on certain days, such as the full moon or Chinese New Year, many people from both the Hindu community and the Chinese ethnic community come and pray, both jointly and wearing traditional Balinese clothing. However, on certain holidays, such as Chinese New Year, Chinese citizens are allowed to wear traditional Chinese clothing. The Barongsai dance also seems to complement and become part of the rituals that are often performed on Lunar New Year. What's more, Chinese citizens are welcome to participate in the ceremony in a way led by stakeholders from the Chinese community who come from the village of Kintamani. The continuity of worship practices between people of Balinese and Chinese descent is a sign of multiculturalism's success. The roots of multiculturalism have been found throughout history and are still present today. This is a reflection of the harmony and respect for differences that exist between these groups, and it is integrated into everyday life.

Ulun Danu Batur Temple has also been designated as one of the tourism sites in Bangli Regency, which is integrated with the development of Batur Traditional Village, wherein the cultural and natural assets of the village, including the temple, hot water spring, lake, and mountain, are designated as tourism attractions to allow local people to work and establish tourism businesses and earn money from tourism (Subadra, 2019b). The openness of local people to welcome other people from distinctive cultural backgrounds to the temple has also supported the multiculturalism that existed at Ulun Danu Temple.

Multiculturalism of Balinese and Chinese ethnics at Tanjung Sari and Besakih Temples in Karangasem

Tanjung Sari Temple is a unique temple with Chinese decorations, and it participates in a larger ritual at Silayukti Temple (Picture 2). The temple is currently managed by the traditional village residents, who are patrons of the temple. This temple is particularly unique because of the presence of Ratu Subandar, a figure with Chinese decorations. This suggests that the Chinese community in Padangbai was closely connected to the Karangasem kingdom in the past. The existence of a Chinese community in Padang Bai is always associated with the presence of traders from Subandar.

The Tanjung Sari Temple, which is worshiped by Hindus, has a Confucian shrine built that is jointly worshiped by the Padangbai Traditional Village community and the surrounding community. The Confucians form a bond in one traditional village, namely the Padangbai Traditional Village. The role of the Chinese community was very central in the economic field (trade), so the ruler or king gave them the privilege of collecting excise (tax). This is the reason for a relationship of mutual need in which the king is greatly assisted and gets taxes for state needs. This is also the basis for giving honour to the ethnic Chinese who originally built the Pelingih Ratu Subadar temple.

The Ratu Subandar shrine was constructed with the approval of the King of Karangasem, and until now, the Tanjung Sari temple administrators, together with descendants of Chinese citizens, have managed and jointly conducted prayers during festival ceremonies at the Tanjung Sari temple. Tanjung Sari Temple holds festivals twice a year that involve the participation of Chinese citizens in managing the temple, both in construction and rituals. Though their participation is not forced, it is very flexible, and apart from participating in traditional and religious activities, Chinese citizens also take part in village administration. Some Chinese citizens also participate as part of the village administration structure. Thus, the existence of ethnic Chinese and local Balinese people have a very harmonious relationship.

Picture 2: *Tanjung Sari temple in Karangasem Regency*



Source: *Field Research 2023*

Another temple that demonstrates a strong bond between Balinese and Chinese can be found at the Besakih Temple, Bali's largest temple. According to research findings, there is worship of Ratu Gede Ngurah Subandar in the shrine or shrine complex, as well as a shrine to Ratu Masiem or Sanghyang Siyem (Fox, 2010). Besakih is officially designated as a cultural tourism site in Bali, which allows anyone to enter the temple for the purposes of worship and tourism. Domestic and international tourists are permitted to perform spiritual activities such as praying and meditation. The daily culture practiced at Besakih Temple can be enjoyed at any time, and even amid the COVID-19 Pandemic, the temple is still open for tourism with tight health protocols and mitigations pursuant to the regulations issued by the national and regional governments, which are applied by the temple management (Subadra, 2021). The real form of this relationship is to continue to pay respects by building shrines in accordance with the harmonious relationship that exists, such as the existence of the shrine of Ratu Gede Ngurah Subandar found in Besakih Temple as a reflection of multiculturalism.

Ratu Mecca Temple, Keramat Temple, and Nurul Hikmah Mosque Unifying Hindu and Islamic in Denpasar City

The Ratu Mecca Temple is a temple that honours the Queen of Mecca, and it is also known for its unique custom of not using pork during ceremonies. This temple is located in Banjar Binoh Ubung Kaja, a village that is known for its Ratu Mecca Temple. This temple is closely related to the Muslim travelers who came to Bali and left their legacy behind. The presence of Arab Islamic traders in Bali is honored by the creation of the Ratu Mecca Temple. Furthermore, the arrival of Dalem Ketut Ngelesir in Bali with 40 Majapahit residents, including Raden Modin and Kiyai Abdul Jalil, was the initial entry of Islam's arrival on the island of Bali, which was centered in the Kingdom of Gelgel. As a result of the arrival of Islam in Bali via trade contacts, many worships of the god of Islamic merchants were born in Bali, accompanied by the development of tolerance. Gedong Ratu Gede Pelinggih Dalem Mecca is the residence or resting place of the Muslim gods or ancestors. This aspect of multiculturalism in the Mecca Temple occurs when the ceremony is performed by non-Muslims. Additionally, Keramat Temple in Denpasar City is an important site for Muslims from Java (Madura Sumenep) and surrounding areas. It is a popular destination for spiritual tourism, and many people visit it in groups using tour buses and guides. The temple has a long and rich history, and its relationship with Hinduism is a testament to the importance of multiculturalism.

The multiculturalism is also found in Islamic worship sites. The Nurul Hikmah Mosque is located in Padangsambean, Denpasar, and has a beautiful building with intricate Balinese ornaments. It is a testament to the harmony between Hinduism and Islam and is frequently used for large celebrations, with the local customary village of Pecalang invited to assist with security. It should be noted that multi-cultural relations have the meaning of togetherness, mutual respect, and mutual respect, namely an ideology that recognizes and glorifies differences and a life that accepts and appreciates diversity, both diversity of sources and diversity of people. Multiculturalism encompasses cultural resources, cultural units, and the diversity of forms of appreciation and collective values toward creativity and innovation.

Conclusion

Multiculturalism is observed in Balinese worship practices. These practices reflect an understanding of equality, recognition of differences, and inter-ethnic relations. These positive developments have fostered integration and tolerance, and the roots of multiculturalism date back to the ancient kingdom of Bali. The flow of people and cultures through trade and expeditions of power has helped to foster the exchange of cultural elements and other physical objects. The development and mobility of humans have played a role in this exchange, both through trade routes and in expeditions of power expansion.

During the reigns of Dalem Segening and Dalem Waturenggong, it was a landmark in the strengthening of foreign cultural elements entering through trade routes. Elements of Balinese culture were mixed with ethnic cultures, and new knowledge about the introduction of a new religion developed intensely through trade routes in Bali. Inter-ethnic relations and their interactions have brought together a variety of cultures that have influenced each other physically, biologically, and ideologically. Physically, there has been imitation and adoption of cultural elements that are exchanged in architecture and goods such as pottery and others. Meanwhile, genealogically, it appears that inter-ethnic marriages have occurred, which has given rise to a mixed culture. Meanwhile, ideologically, inter-ethnic meetings and interactions have brought about cultural acculturation and innovation, which has led to new knowledge from migrants entering Bali. Such knowledge is similar to religious teachings, which at that

time were developing, namely Islamic teachings. The knowledge of Islamic teachings could only be widely spread on the island of Bali after the Gelgel kingdom's influence began to fade, particularly near the end of Dalem Dimade's reign. Along with Hinduism, the majority religion, Islam began to develop and become a new religion. The historical context demonstrates that Bali's pluralism is the result of a variety of causal factors, including cultural encounters via trade routes and, much earlier, population migration from Java via territorial control expansion in the context of expanding royal power in ancient times.

Bali's rich cultural diversity is most evident through its extensive trade routes, which have facilitated cultural diffusion. Through these pathways, we see evidence of social contact and religious practices among the diverse ethnic groups that live on Bali. The Balinese use symbols to show respect for and glorify all of the ethnic groups that contribute to Bali's culture. By doing so, they help to strengthen social relations among these different groups. Bali is a place where diversity is celebrated, and this diversity is a source of strength. The numerous religious sites on Bali prove the value of religious diversity. Understanding religious diversity allows us to appreciate multiculturalism and the many contributions that various religions have made to Bali's history. Additionally, the temple is frequented by many people who come for sightseeing and religious worship, regardless of their religious beliefs. This multiculturalism in worship is a positive trend that has great potential for the future of Bali tourism. By promoting an understanding of multiculturalism through travel, we can create a sustainable tourism industry that benefits everyone involved.

References

- Adian, D. G. (2002). Multiculturalism, Politics, and Solidarity. In A. Danusiri & W. Alhaziri (Eds.), *Education Is Multicultural: Some Ideas* (pp. 3–4). Technology Aesthetics Science; Variety.
- Agung, I. A. A. G. (1989). *Bali in the XIX Century: The Struggle of the People and Kings Against Dutch Colonialism 1808-1906*. Gadjah Mada University Press.
- Aliffiati. (2012). The Ideology of Multiculturalism and Unity in Diversity. In A. A. N. A. Kumbara & I. G. Suka (Eds.), *Anthropological Discourse Rebuilding Cultural Texts Towards Self-Transformation in Multiculturalism* (p. 130). Laras Library.
- Ardana, I. K. (2012). *Multiculturalism in Culture and Tourism Development*. Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy.
- Ardika, I. W. (2004). Archaeological Evidence for the Formation of the Roots of Multiculturalism. In I. W. Ardika & D. Putra (Eds.), *Cultural Politics and Ethnic Identity*. Udayana University Faculty of Letters - Bali Mangsi.
- Ardika, I. W. (2011). Relations between Chinese and Balinese Communities: Multiculturalism Perspective in Sulistyawati 2011. *Integration of Chinese Culture into Balinese and Indonesian Cultures*. In *Integration of Chinese Culture into Balinese and Indonesian Cultures* (pp. 1–12). Udayana University.
- Ardika, I. W. (2017). *One Holy Place for Two People: Tolerance Between Religions in Bali*. Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy.
- Ardika, I W. and Subadra, I N. (2018). *WARISAN BUDAYA DUNIA: Pura Taman Ayun dan Pura Tirtha Empul sebagai Daya Tarik Wisata di Bal*. Denpasar: Pustaka Larasan.
- Ardika, I. W. (2022). *Balinese People and Culture 2000 Years Ago*. Nulus Private.
- Argawa, I. N. (2018). *QUEEN AYU MAS SUBANDAR*. Ministry of Education and Culture Language Development and Development Agency.

- Arta, K. S. (2019). Trade in North Bali in the Age of the Ancient Balinese Kingdom from a Historical Geographical Perspective. *Scientific Journal of Social Sciences*, 5(2), 112–114. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jiis.v5i2.22516>.
- Aydin, H. (2014). Multiculturalism. In: In L. H. Cousins, (Eds). *Encyclopedia of Human Services and Diversity*. Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publications, Inc. DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.4135/9781483346663.n385> Print pages: 889-894.
- Bankier-Karp, A. L. (2022). Catalysts of Connectedness: A Case for Greater Complexity in Religious Identity Formation Research. *Review of Religious Research*. Vol. 64, pp.343–373. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s13644-022-00486-1>
- Collins-Kreiner, N. (2009). The geography of pilgrimage and tourism: Transformations and implications for applied geography. *Applied Geography*. Doi:10.1016/j.apgeog.2009.02.001.
- Collins-Kreiner, N., Shmueli, D. F. and Gal, M. B. (2013). Spatial transgression of new religious sites in Israel. *Applied Geography*. Vol.40, pp.103-114.
- Denzin, N. K. and Lincoln, Y. S. (2018). *The SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Research*. California: SAGE Publications, Inc.
- Dhuroruddin, M. (2014). Balinese Muslims are “searching for lost harmony again.” Al Kautsal Library.
- Fereday, J. and Muir-Cochrane, E. (2006). Demonstrating Rigor Using Thematic Analysis: A Hybrid Approach of Inductive and Deductive Coding and Theme Development. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*. Vol. 5, No.1. pp. 80-92. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1177/160940690600500107>
- Fox, D. J. S. (2010). *Besakih Temple: Balinese temples, religion, and society* (J. Atmaja, Ed.). Lararan Library; Udayana University Press; KITLV-Jakarta.
- Geertz, C. (2000). *State Theatre*. Canisius.
- Giddens, A. and Held, D. (1982). *Classes, Power and Conflict: classical and contemporary debates* (Alimandan, Ed.). Eagle.
- Hefner, R. W. (2007). Multiculturalism and Citizenship in Malaysia, Singapore, Indonesia. In R. W. Hefner (Ed.), *The Politics of Multiculturalism Challenges the Reality of Nationality* (p. 16). Canisius Publishers.
- Hong, Y. and Khei, M. (2014). Dynamic Multiculturalism: The Interplay of Socio-Cognitive, Neural, and Genetic Mechanisms. In: V. Benet-Martínez and Y. Hong (Eds). *The Oxford Handbook of Multicultural Identity*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Huang, J., Zheng, X. and Lee, C. (2023). Materiality, Experience and the Body: The Catholic Pilgrimage of Sheshan in Shanghai, China. *Religions* 14: 40. <https://doi.org/10.3390/rel14010040>
- Idoko, P. E. (2022). Islamic Religious Education Textbooks in a Pluralist Nigeria. *Religions* 14: 42. <https://doi.org/10.3390/rel14010042>.
- Kimanen, A. (2018). Approaching culture, negotiating practice: Finnish educators’ discourses on cultural diversity. *JOURNAL OF MULTICULTURAL DISCOURSES*, VOL. 13, NO. 4, 334–347 <https://doi.org/10.1080/17447143.2018.1546309>
- Koefoed, L. and Haldrup, M. (2020). Orientalism. In A. Kobayashi (Eds). *International Encyclopedia of Human Geography*. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-08-102295-5.10203-3>.
- Koentjaraningrat. (1990). *Introduction to Anthropology*. PT Rineka Cipta.
- Kollar, R. and Fleischmann, F. (2022). Does Religion Foster Prejudice Among Adherents of all World Religions? A Comparison Across Religions. *Review of Religious Research*. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s13644-022-00509-x>
- Kumbara, A. A. N. A. and Sutrisno, N. (2012). Building Social Coession in Multicultural Communities in Hindu Perspective. In A. A. N. A. Kumbara & I. G. Suka (Eds.),

- Anthropological Discourse Rereading Cultural Texts Towards Self-Transformation in Multiculturalism (p. 177). Laras Library.
- Liro, J., Soljan, I. and Bilska-Wodecka, E. (2023). Symbolic Religious Landscape: Religious and Patriotic Symbolism in the Pilgrimage Centres in Poland. *Religions* 14: 33. <https://doi.org/10.3390/rel14010033>.
- Mantra, I. B. (2004). *Philosophy of Study and Methods of Social Studies*. Student Library.
- Mecca Temple. (2020, March). <https://www.denpasarkota.go.id/wisata/pura-mekah>.
- Moleong, L. J. (2002). *Qualitative Study Methodology*. Rosdakarya.
- Musa, R. (2009). Portraits and Prospects for the Development of Multicultural Communities in Bali. In *the World Village, Portraits of Bali's Multiculturalism*. Ministry of Culture and Tourism.
- Ngurah, I G. M. (2010). *Interreligious Dialogue in a Multicultural Society in Denpasar City [Dissertation]*. Udayana University.
- Pageh, I. M., and Rai, I. B. (2014). Identification of Nyegara Gunung Socio-Cultural Patterns in North Bali (In Perception of Trihita Karana). *Journal of Cultural Studies*, 10, 31–32.
- Picard, M. (2008). Balinese identity as tourist attraction: from 'cultural tourism' (pariwisata budaya) to 'Bali erect' (ajeg Bali). *Tourist Studies*. Vol.8, No.2, pp.155-173.
- Pradnya, I. M. A. S. (2020). *Multicultural Temple at Gambur Anglayang Temple*. Nilacakra.
- Pringle, R. (2004). *A Short History of Bali*. Allen and Unwin.
- Pujastawa, I. B. G. (2012). *Interpreting the Discourse of Ajeg Bali Towards a Bhinneka Tunggal Ika Indonesian Society*. Jakarta: Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy.
- Purna, I. M., Jayanti, I. G. N., and Rupa, I. W. (2013). *Multicultural Educational Values in Ethnic Culture*. PT. Balinese Printing.
- Putra, I N.D. and Hitchcock, M. (2007). *Pura Besakih: a world heritage site contested. In Indonesia and the Malay World*. London: Routledge Taylor and Francis Group. pp. 225-237.
- Putra, I. N. D. (2008). *Bali Under Political Power*. Meaning Foundation.
- Rattansi, A. (2011). *Multiculturalism: A Very Short Introduction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Said, E. W. (1985). *Orientalism* (A. Mohammad, Ed.). Pustaka - Selman Library Bandung Institute of Technology.
- Schaublin, & Brigitta Hauser. (2014). From Subandar to Tridarma: Transformations and Interactions of the Chinese Community in Bali. In Schaublin, Brigitta Hauser, & David D. Harnish (Eds.), *Between Harmony and Discrimination: Negotiating Religious Identities within Majority-Minority Relationships in Bali and Lombok* (pp. 84–111). Brill.
- Seymour-Smit, C. (1993). *Mac-Millan Dictionary of Anthropology*. MacMillan Press.
- Simsek, M., van Tubergen, F. and Fleischmann, F. (2021). Religion and Intergroup Boundaries: Positive and Negative Ties Among Youth in Ethnically and Religiously Diverse School Classes in Western Europe. *Review of Religious Research*. Vol. 64, pp.1–33. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s13644-021-00473-y>
- Sommier, M. (2018). 'Culture' as a discursive resource in newspaper articles from Le Monde about secularism: constructing 'us' through strategic oppositions with religion. *JOURNAL OF MULTICULTURAL DISCOURSES* 2018, VOL. 13, NO. 3, 283–299. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17447143.2018.1437161>.
- Suarjaya, I. W. (2012). *Ethnicity Diversity in Building Indonesianness in Bali*. Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy.
- Suastika, I. N., Gede, D., Mangku, S., Putu, N., Yuliantini, R., and Lasmawan, W. (2020). *The Multi-Ethnic Community Integration Model in Bali: Philosophical Base and Proto*

- Multiculturalism in Balinese Society. In *International Journal of Criminology and Sociology* (Vol. 9).
- Subadra, I N. (2015). *Preserving the Sanctity of Temple Sites in Bali: Challenges from Tourism*. Lincoln (United Kingdom): PhD Thesis. University of Lincoln.
- Subadra, I N. (2019a). *Gaining In-Depth Understanding Through Mixed Methods Case Study: An Empirical Research from Temple Tourism in Bali Research Method Cases*. London: Sage Publication.
- Subadra, I N. (2019b). *Alleviating poverty through community-based tourism: Evidence from Batur Natural Hot Spring Water – Bali*. *African Journal of Hospitality, Tourism and Leisure*, Volume 8 (51)
- Subadra, I N. (2021). *Destination management solution post COVID-19: Best practice from Bali – A world cultural tourism destination*. In: V.B.B. Gowreesunkar, S.W. Maingi, H. Roy and R. Micera (Eds). *Tourism Destination Management in a Post-Pandemic Context: Global Issues and Destination Management Solutions*. Bingley (United Kingdom): Emerald Publishing Limited.
- Subadra, I N. (2022). *Understanding the cultural ecosystem service of heritage tourism: the case of Jatiluwih Heritage Tourism*. Routledge Publication.
- Sudiana I G. N. and Nuriawan, I N. A. (2022). *Traces of Multiculturalism at Panean Pulaki Singaraja Temple, Bali*. *Journal of Balinese Studies*, Vol.12.
- Sumba, I. G. B. R. W., Semarajaya, C. G. A. and Astawa, I. N. G. (2018). *Identification of the landscape of the Gambur Anglayang State temple in Kubudindingan Village, Kubudindingan District, Buleleng Regency*. *JOURNAL OF LANDSCAPE ARCHITECTURE*, 4(2).
- Sutjiati, B., I Wayan Ardika, I W. and Dhana, I N. (2010). *From Eyes to the Wedding Ceremony to Pakraman Village. Study of the Relationship between Balinese and Chinese in Bali* (Jiwa Atmaja, Ed.). Udayana Press University.
- Taras, R. (2013). *Challenging multiculturalism: European models of diversity*. Edinburgh University Press.
- Triguna, I. B. G. Y. (2011). *Why Bali is Unique*. Family Journal Library.
- Vermeer, P. and Scheepers, P. (2021). *Church Growth in Times of Secularization: A Case Study of People Joining Evangelical Congregations in the Netherlands*. *Review of Religious Research*. Vol.63, pp.43–66. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s13644-020-00434-x>
- Wahyuni, D. I. G. A. (2021). *PRAMANA Journal of Research Results*. In *PRAMANA Journal of Research Results* (Vol. 1, Issue 1).
- Widiarya, G., and Margi, K. (2013). *Gambur Anglayang State Temple in Pakraman Kubudindingan Village, Buleleng, Bali (History, Structure, and Its Potential as a Media for Multicultural Education for the Surrounding Communities)*. 1(1). <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.23887/jjps.v1i1.1008>