

Employing competitive forms in private colleges in Iraq to improve their efficiency and effectiveness

By

Abdelaziz Dammak¹

¹Faculty of Economics and Management Sciences, University of Sfax, Tunisia

Muthana Abdulwahab Jumaah²

²Faculty of Economics and Management Sciences, University of Sfax, Tunisia

³Al-Maarif University College, Ramadi city, 31001, Iraq

* Corresponding Author: Email: muthana.abdulwhab@uoa.edu.iq

abdelaziz.dammak@fsegs.rnu.tn

Abstract

This study aims to know to what extent competitive forms can affect the improvement of the efficiency and effectiveness of private colleges in Iraq, where this study was applied in three civil colleges in Iraq, namely the Faculty of University Knowledge, The Tigris University College and the College of The University prisoners, where competitive forms were used as an independent variable that included dimensions are competition for materials and sponsors, competition for students and competition to attract the professor to seek excellence. According to the researchers, these standards can play a major role, especially in improving performance, which has been measured by the efficiency and effectiveness of private colleges. The research sample includes three private colleges, Almaarif University, Isra'a University, Dijla university, 261 answers were obtained and for analysis of the data, the standard statistical method package was used according to the SPSS system and the results showed a correlation between competitive forms and institutional performance. We also find that the most related dimensions to institutional performance were after the search for excellence followed by competition for students and after competing for teachers and competition for resources. After sponsors, it has achieved a negative impact on institutional performance.

Keywords: competitive forms, efficiency, effectiveness, private colleges.

Introduction

The concept of competitiveness has become one of the modern concepts that have been employed in educational institutions, both governmental and private, and its importance intensified after many universities and colleges in the world obtained academic and accreditation recognition, where the importance of competitiveness of universities lies in making the most of all the possibilities available to them, with the aim of reaching the best outcomes commensurate with the requirements of international quality standards and the needs of the labor market. To become competitive in higher education in light of these clear and pressing issues that have presented themselves in a number of forms, such as competing for students, university professors and how to finance universities and their sponsors (Alzabari et al., 2019). And the use of modern methods of excellence to improve its performance and develop its programs, especially in the presence of cross-border education, Therefore, the use of Iraqi private colleges for the concept of competitiveness as a means of improving their efficiency and effectiveness is a great and clear indication of the determination of their leadership and responsibility towards the orientation of excellence, creativity and academic

reputation, and international accreditation, and if the pursuit of competitiveness is the global slogan raised by international universities, it is a first step to raise it by private colleges in Iraq not for the purpose of maintaining their place in society and achieving success but to continue to maintain this success (Majali, 2021). From this point of view, competitiveness can be defined by the researchers' vision (as a set of unique and difficult-to-imitate characteristics and characteristics of universities through which they can give these universities the right to preference and outperform other universities and colleges).

The problem of study is the increase in the number of private colleges across Iraq, which exceeded more than (60) according to the latest statistics of Iraqi higher education for 2020, which caused the lack of confidence in these colleges to achieve scientific progress, which obliged them to change this idea by entering into a sharp competition not only between them but with universities and public colleges for survival not for the strongest but for the better, the problem lies in the extent of the competitiveness of forms of competitiveness as a basic means of upgrading private colleges and improving their efficiency and institutional effectiveness like the same. With the rest of the public colleges to become a basic importance and a force of attraction for the student and professor and serve the community cards commensurate with the labor market has no freedom of choice to stay except by competing for the better and the best. As a result of the intense competition between public and private universities, the aim of this study was to know the competitiveness of the forms of competitiveness in universities and to employ them to improve the performance of private colleges in Iraq.

The new view of university learning as productive and investment, which raises the level of private colleges in using competitiveness as a pull force and gain for both the student and the professor.

Previous studies

There are many studies that have addressed the concept of competitiveness in university institutions and colleges as a study (Dimitrova & Dimitrova, 2017). Which dealt with the subject of competitiveness in Bulgarian universities and stressed that the importance of competitiveness and it does not come from a coincidence and explained the study on the presence of 51 universities in Bulgaria, including 14 private universities and 37 government, this study aims to find other competitive sources and study (Štimac & Šimić, 2021) which emphasized the competitiveness of higher education and the need to market orientation and quality of service and study (Bisaria, 2013) which addressed the reasons for achieving competitive advantage through private universities (Azizi et al., 2013), which dealt with competition between public and private universities and international experiences, and a study (Tan et al., 2015) which addressed the determinants of competitiveness in quality in private higher education institutions in Malaysia, (Kufaine, 2014) which examined the most important competitive strategies in higher education, the Case study of malawi city and the study (Wangari, 2015), which touched on the use of competitive strategies on the performance of middle-level colleges and the study (Al-Taie et al., 2017) touched on the reality of Saudi public universities and their level at the local and global levels and how to develop them and place them in the global competitive framework with advanced international universities, and study (Abdel Rahman, 2012) Addressed the role of the private sector in the development of competitive educational services in cooperation with the public sector, and the study (Abu Saada, 2014) aimed to identify the most important requirements for achieving competitiveness in Egyptian universities and the efforts made by Mansoura University to reach that competitive position, and the study (Al-Hout, 2015) the study aimed to analyze the concept of

competitiveness between universities and discuss the factors that led to the increase in competition between universities.

As for studies on efficiency and effectiveness, there are many studies, including one (Al-Mawla, 2021), a study (Rattlesnake, 2015), a study (Djogofi, 2016), a study (Al-Hout, 2015) and a study (Al-Saleh, 2020) Study (Ilona & Evelina, 2013) and Argyropoulou, 2013) and study (Al-Nouri & Al-Hiti, 2021) and as a result of this hal hal number of studies we are not surprised that some researchers and studies highlight efficiency and effectiveness as a basic and pivotal criterion in their studies we find, for example, a study (Bin Labbad, 2014) They put most of their study on educational competence to achieve mastery, excellence and overcome the shortcomings of learning institutions and we find the study (Muhammad et al., 2014) focused on the theoretical rooting of the concept of efficiency, effectiveness and the natural relationship between them where it became constant in the administrative concept that the measures associated with efficiency and effectiveness are successful, so only the researchers' vision that the focus on effectiveness and efficiency did not come from diligence or from a vacuum but from the reality filled by research and intellectuals And specialists (Talab et al., 2017).

Research methodology

Sample study

Rowley and Sherman, 2007, in their book (From Planning to Change) identified five types or criteria and was considered as a form of competition in universities, namely competition for resources - the search for sponsors, competition for students, competition for teacher attraction, competition for excellence (Thijeel et al., 2018) and here is a simple pause as these forms of university competitiveness and according to the researchers' vision can be in the interest of Iraqi private colleges directly or indirectly for the reasons of several reasons, namely, financial independence. The administrative is a complete flexibility in dealing with data and variables and in accordance with the circumstances and challenges, and this can be explained more and for the same competitive forms in universities and the corresponding forms of competitiveness in Iraqi private colleges, and the following chart shows these forms and their equivalents in private colleges.



figure1. Prepared by the researchers

The study community consists of a group of private colleges, namely the Faculty of University Knowledge, the College of The University prisoners, the University College of *Res Militaris*, vol.12, n°2, Summer-Autumn 2022

Tigris and obtained (261) answers and to analyze the data was used the package of statistical methods accepted and according to the system (SPSS). To complement the research procedures, the researcher conducted numerous interviews with a group of experts and specialists to benefit from their opinions and experience on the subject matter of the research. A range of personal and functional variables have been selected for respondents in the research sample and these variables such as (sex, age, scientific qualification, total length of service in college). The proportion of males in the research sample was 67.06%, while females recorded 32.93%. It is indicated that (2%) of the sample members are aged 30 years and under, 16.46 percent of the sample members are aged 31 to 40, and 55.81 percent of the sample members are aged 41 to 50. 27.71 percent of the sample members are over the age of 51. Years and (15.7%) of the sample members have 6 to 10 years of experience in the research sample, and 42.6 percent of the sample members have 11 to 15 years of experience. The percentage (39.4 percent) is more than 16 years old.

Results of the study hypotheses test

The first main hypothesis (the existence of a morally significant relationship between competitive forms in universities and the institutional performance of private colleges) and the subseat of the hypotheses:

Hypothesis II: There is a moral relationship between competitive forms (competition for resources- sponsors- competition for students - competition to attract teachers - search for excellence) and after competence

Sub-hypothesis II: There is a moral relationship between competitive forms (competition for resources- sponsors- competition for students - competition to attract a professor - the search for excellence) and after effectiveness. To test these hypotheses, a set of statistical tests will be used to first verify the strength and direction of the supposed relationships between variables, and the absence of a double-pace problem; From which many of the results can be summarized in the following points:

The correlation between the variables of the study model (the variable in the form of competitiveness) and the dependent variable (institutional performance) was dismissive and statistically significant at the level (0.01). The correlation rate (.706*) is good, reflecting a significant homogeneity in the extent to which the sample researched perceives the study variables, which are consistent with the administrative logic and expected signals.

We also find that the most associated dimensions with institutional performance were after the search for excellence with a strong correlation factor of (.883*), followed by competition for students with a factor also strongly related to a factor (.846*) and then after competing for teachers with a strong factor of (.831**), then the variable competition for resources and sponsors comes in last place with a negative impact of (-.552-*,*,.485-*)

Consequently, the least linked to institutional performance are the determinants. Consequently, based on these linkages, we can expect a direct positive impact of competitive forms on institutional performance, both overall and on subdivisions (efficiency and effectiveness). Through the fore and our findings, correlation hypotheses (which provide for a morally significant correlation between competitive forms as a whole and institutional performance as a whole) can be accepted.

Table (1) the correlation factor between variables

R	Competitiveness over resources	Sponsors	competition for students	Competition to attract professors	Searching for excellence	Competitive forms	Efficiency potency	
Sponsors	.803*	1						
competition for students	-.298-*	-.319-*	1					
Competition to attract professors	-.348-*	-.427-*	.823*	1				
Searching for excellence	-.405-*	-.334-*	.816*	.778*	1			
Competitive forms	.225*	.236*	.781*	.713*	.719*	1		
Efficiency potency	-.376-*	-.417-*	.872*	.846*	.882*	.711*	1	
institutional performance	-.650-*	-.484-*	.702*	.699*	.761*	.705*	.730*	1
	-.552-*	-.485-*	.846*	.831*	.883*	.706*	0.866	.931*

Testing impact hypotheses

The main hypothesis (there is a morally significant effect of competitive forms on institutional performance in private colleges and universities researched). To test this hypothesis, the analysis of the simple regression will be based on the fact that the independent variable is (competitive forms) and the variable adopted is (institutional performance). . With regard to the results of the ANOVA contrast analysis to test the morale of the simple regression, it was as in the following table:

Table (2) Total squares, selection lab square and F news to test impact relationship

Contrast sources for quality variable	sum of squares	degrees of freedom	mean squares	Selection coefficient square	F value	Probability value sig
Regression	21.086	1	21.086			
Residual	36.269	247	.147	0.368	143.6	0.00
Total	57.356	248				

From the previous table (2) we note that the selection factor square was valued (0.368), i.e. the variable of competitive forms explains what 368% of the change in the institutional performance variable in private colleges, The calculated F value is (143.6) and compared to the freely scheduled F value (1,147) and its value (3.84) we note that the f computational value is greater than the table f value and thus we accept the main hypothesis and this is confirmed by the probability value of the test and was (0.00) below the level of significance (0.00) This indicates that the model is valid for measuring the causal relationship between the independent variable and the dependent variable, i.e. we accept the previous hypothesis in the sense (there is a morally significant effect of the dimension of competitive forms in the institutional performance of the researched colleges). As for testing the simple linear regression factors related to the model, which can be reached through the following table

Table (3) Simple linear regression transactions

Independent variable transactions	Standard Transactions Beta)(St. Error standard error	The value of the calculated t test	Probability value sig
Constant	-.281-	.381	-.737-	.462
Institutional performance	1.040	.087	11.983	.000

We note that the t test value of the factor (institutional performance) has reached (11.98) and its probability value (0.00) which is below the level of indication (0.05), indicating that the variable (competitive forms) has a statistically significant effect at a moral level. The value of this factor was (1.04) in the simple regression equation, meaning that a change of one unit of the competitive form variable would change by (1.04) from the institutional performance variable in private colleges.

The second hypothesis: (the existence of a moral significance of the subdivisions of the forms of competitiveness (competitiveness on materials - sponsors - competitiveness over students - competitiveness over professors - the search for excellence) on performance in private colleges). To test this hypothesis, the analysis of multiple linear regression will be based on the fact that independent variables are the dimensions (competitive forms) and the variable adopted is (institutional performance) of private colleges. As for the results of the ANOVA contrast analysis to test the morale of multiple linear regression, it was as in the following table:

Table (4) Total squares, selection coefficient square and F news to test impact relationship

Contrast sources for quality variable	sum of squares	Degrees of freedom	mean squares	Selection coefficient square	F value	Probability value sig
Regression	51.119	5	10.224			
Residual	6.237	243	.026	0.891	398.341	0.00
Total	57.356	248				

From the previous table (4) we note that the selection factor square was valued (0.89), i.e. the dimensions of competitive forms explain what 89% of the institutional performance variable in the researched colleges, The remaining (11%) is due to other variables that did not enter the model, and the calculated F value is (398.341) and compared to the f value of the table with a degree of freedom (5,243) and its value (2.21) we note that the calculated F value is greater than the value of the scheduled F and thus we accept the hypothesis and this is confirmed by the probability value of the test. It was below the level of significance (1%), which indicates that the model is valid for measuring the causal relationship between independent variables and the dependent variable, i.e. we accept the previous hypothesis in the sense (there is a morally significant effect between the dimensions of competitive forms and institutional performance in private colleges and universities).

To test multiple linear regression transactions related to the model, which can be reached through the following table.

Table (5) Multiple linear regression transactions

Independent variable transactions	Standard Transactions Beta)(St. Error standard error	The value of the calculated t test	Probability value sig
Constant	2.043	.197	10.393	.000
Institutional performance	-.332-	.046	-7.227-	.000
Sponsors	.042	.031	1.331	.184
competition for students	.248	.038	6.471	.000
Competition to attract professors	.194	.035	5.504	.000
Searching for excellence	.382	.041	9.261	.000

After testing the subdivisions of the variable of competitive forms (dependent variable) on the independent variable as a whole (institutional performance), we will test the independent

variable as a whole (competitive forms) at the distance of competence in private colleges through the following hypothesis:

The third hypothesis (there is a morally significant effect of the variable of competitive forms at the distance of competence in private colleges.

With regard to the results of the ANOVA contrast analysis to test the morale of regression, it was as in the following table:

Table (6) Total squares, selection lab square and F news to test impact relationship

Contrast sources for quality variable	sum of squares	Degrees of freedom	mean squares	Selection coefficient square	F value	Probability value sig
Regression	32.302	1	32.302			
Residual	33.474	247	.136	0.491	238.35	0.00
Total	65.776	248				

From the previous table (6) we note that the selection factor square was valued (0.491), i.e. the variable of competitive forms explains what 49% of the change in after competence in private colleges, The calculated F value is (238.35) and compared to the F value of freely scheduled (1,147) and its value (3.84) we note that the f computational value is greater than the value of the scheduled F and thus we accept the third main hypothesis, as confirmed by the probability value of the test and was (0.00) below the level of significance (0.01) This indicates that the model is valid for measuring the causal relationship between the independent variable and the dependent variable, i.e. we accept the previous hypothesis in the sense (there is a morally significant effect of the dimension of competitive forms in the efficiency of the researched colleges). As for testing the linear regression transactions related to the model, which can be reached through the following table

Table (7) Simple linear regression coefficients

Independent variable transactions	Standard Transactions Beta)(St. Error standard error	The value of the calculated t test	Probability value sig
Constant	-1.454-	.366	-3.973-	.000
Institutional performance	1.287	.083	15.439	.000

We note that the t test value of the factor (institutional performance) has reached (15.439) and its probability value (0.00) which is below the level of indication (0.01), indicating that the variable (competitive forms) has a statistically significant effect at a moral level The value of this factor was (1.287) in the simple regression equation in the sense that a change of one unit of the competitive form variable will change by (1.287) from the efficiency variable in private colleges. We test the independent variable as a whole (competitive forms) at a distance in private colleges through the following hypothesis:

The third hypothesis (there is a morally significant effect of the variable of competitive forms at a distance of effectiveness in private colleges.

With regard to the results of the ANOVA contrast analysis to test the morale of regression, it was as in the following table:

Table (8) Total squares, selection coefficient square and F news to test impact relationship

Contrast sources for quality variable	sum of squares	Degrees of freedom	mean squares	Selection coefficient square	F value	Probability value sig
Regression	12.253	1	12.253			
Residual	54.556	247	.221	0.183	55.475	0.00
Total	66.809	248				

From the previous table (8) we note that the selection factor square was rated (0.183), i.e. the variable of competitive forms explains what 18% of the change in the dimension of effectiveness in private colleges, The calculated F value is (55.475) and compared to the F value of the freely scheduled F (1,147) and its value (3.84) we note that the f computational value is greater than the value of the table F and thus we accept the fourth main hypothesis, as confirmed by the probability value of the test and was (0.00) below the level of significance (0.01) This indicates that the model is valid for measuring the causal relationship between the independent variable and the dependent variable, i.e. we accept the previous hypothesis in the sense (there is a morally significant effect of the dimension of competitive forms in the effectiveness of researched colleges). As for testing the simple linear regression factors related to the model, which can be reached through the following table

Table (9) Simple linear regression transactions

Independent variable transactions	Standard Transactions Beta)(St. Error standard error	The value of the calculated t test	Probability value sig
Constant	0.892	0.467	1.910	.057
Institutional performance	0.793	0.106	7.448	.000

We note that the t test value of the factor (institutional performance) was 7.448) and its probability value (0.00) which is below the level of indication (0.01), indicating that the variable (competitive forms) has a statistically significant effect at a moral level (0.01) on the variable (effectiveness) in the researched colleges and that the value of this factor was (0.793) in the equation of simple regression in the sense that the change by one unit of the variable competitive forms will change by (0.793) from the efficiency variable in private colleges. The remaining 21 percent is due to other variables that are not in the current study model.

Conclusion

All global data openly serve private education and the future role, both across developed and developing countries, including Iraq, so civil colleges can improve their institutional performance and even compete with public universities, especially since higher education is subject to market mechanisms and requirements, including free competition, which can be motivated to develop its quality and services. The main ones are shown as follows (El-Badawy et al., 2018) all of these indicators are for the benefit of civil colleges and not government, which confirms the future and competitiveness of these colleges in the near future, the national colleges are financially independent and looking for competition, tuition fees for

university service and informatics is the competitiveness of these colleges to provide quality education that corresponds to the desired demand and specialization.

From the view on the types and forms of competitiveness in universities we see these dimensions are more related in private colleges in Iraq than to the government for an important reason, which is the reality of Iraqi civil colleges based on student fees (financial resource) and therefore will positively affect the provision of the human resource (prof. competent) to return this return to the customer (student) in providing the best distinguished service to become the university environment an attraction for the student and professor at the same time.

References

- Alzabari, S.A.H., Talab, H.R., Flayyih, H.H. (2019). The effect of internal training and auditing of auditors on supply chain management: An empirical study in listed companies of Iraqi stock exchange for the period 2012-2015. *International Journal of Supply Chain Management*, (5), pp. 1070–1075.
- Thijeel, A.M., Flayyih, H.H., Talab, H.R. (2018). The relationship between audit quality and accounting conservatism in the Iraqi banks | La relación entre la calidad de la auditoría y el conservadurismo contable en los bancos Iraquíes. *Opcion*, 34(Special Issue 15), pp. 1564–1592.
- Talab, H.R., Hasan, S.I., Flayyih, H.H., Hussein, N.A. (2017). Analysis of mental accounting: A case study of listed companies in Iraqi stock exchange. *International Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 2017, 11(4), pp. 684–699.
- Al-Taie, B.F.K., Flayyih, H.H., Talab, H.R. (2017). Measurement of income smoothing and its effect on accounting conservatism: An empirical study of listed companies in the Iraqi stock exchange. *International Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 2017, 11(3), pp. 710–719.
- Abdel Rahman, Saber Adly Shaker, (2012). Education reform and competitiveness in the light of international experiences, *The Scientific Journal of Research and Business Studies*, No. 2.
- Abedi, Jamila, Boujelal, Aisha (2016). The role of organizational change management in improving institutional performance - a field study at the Chlef Irrigation and Drainage Unit in Khemis Miliana, Master's thesis, Jilali University, Naama.
- Abu Saada, H (2014). Requirements to Achieving Competitiveness in Egyptian Universities: A Case Study on Mansoura University, *Journal of the College of Education*, Issue 100, Volume 25, Egypt
- Al-Hout, Mohamed Sabry. (2015). Competitiveness between universities, *Journal of Educational Knowledge*, Issue 5, Volume 3.
- Al-Mawla, Muthanna Abdel-Wahhab (2019): The impact of orientation on total quality management and organizational excellence on sustainable competitive advantage in private colleges - an applied study on some private colleges in Iraq, Master's thesis, Sudan University of Science and Technology, College of Graduate Studies.
- Al-Nouri, Abdulsalam Ali Hussein, Al-Hiti, Ali Jubeir Mustafa (2021) The role of quality management and its impact on institutional performance: a field study at the University of Anbar, *Anbar University Journal of Economic and Administrative Sciences*, Volume 13, Issue 3 0
- Al-Saleh, Aya Khalil Muhammad (2020) The Role of Administrative Creativity in Institutional Performance in Application to Research and Development Centers in Giad Industrial Group for the period 2015-2020, PhD thesis, El-Nelain University, Sudan
- Argyropoulou, M. (2013). Information systems' effectiveness and organisational performance.

- Azizi, A., Elezi, Z., & Mazreku, A. (2013). COMPETITION BETWEEN PUBLIC AND PRIVATE UNIVERSITIES: INTERNATIONAL EXPERIENCES AND CASE OF MACEDONIA. *Journal of Educational & Instructional Studies in the World*, 3 (2).
- Bartuševičienė, I., & Šakalytė, E. (2013). Organizational assessment: effectiveness vs. efficiency. *Social Transformations in Contemporary Society*, 1(1), 45-53.
- Bin Labbad, Muhammad, Bin Issa, Ibrahim, (2014) Educational efficiency between reality requirements and measurement indicators, *Algerian Journal of Public Finance*, Issue 4
- Bisaria, G. (2013). Achieving competitive advantage by private management colleges or private universities. *International Journal of Social Science & Interdisciplinary Research (IJSSIR)*, 2 (3), 22773630.
- Dimitrova, G., & Dimitrova, T. (2017). Competitiveness of the universities: measurement capabilities. *Trakia Journal of Sciences*, 15 (1), 311-316.
- Djogofi, Fadia (2016). The role of SWOT strategic analysis in improving the performance of the organization, a case study of the Ziban Mills Corporation, Kantara - Biskra - Master's thesis, Faculty of Economic, Commercial and Management Sciences, University of Mohamed Khider - Algeria
- El-Badawy, Mahmoud Fawzy Ahmed, Mustafa, Emad Negm Abdel-Hakim (2018) Enhancing the competitiveness of Egyptian higher education as an approach to developing the reality of its institutions in the classifications of elite international universities, *the Educational Journal*, Issue 53
- Gituku, G. W., & Kagiri, A. (2015). Effects of competitive strategies on performance of middle level colleges in Thika sub county. *International Academic Journal of Human Resource and Business Administration*, 1 (5), 83-106.
- Goñi Guembe, P. (2014). Higher education as a marketable product. A critical discourse analysis of universities' persuasive strategies to recruit students (Bachelor's thesis).
- Kufaine, N. (2014). Competitive strategies in higher education: Case of universities in Malawi. *The International Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities Invention*, 1 (7), 490-499.
- Majali, Ratib Aref (2021) The Impact of Strategic Intelligence in Improving Institutional Performance in Public Universities, Volume Two, Issue Two, *The Scientific Journal of Multidisciplinary Scientific Research*.
- Molesworth, M., Scullion, R., & Nixon, E. (Eds.) (2011). *The marketisation of higher education and the student as consumer*. London: Routledge.
- Muhammad, Doaa Reda Riad, Effendi, Attia Hussein, (2014) Theoretical rooting of the concepts of efficiency and effectiveness and analysis of the nature of their relationship: Research in the development of administrative thought, *Journal of Administrative Research*, Volume 32, Issue 3
- Rattlesnake, morning. (2015). Evaluating the efficiency of the performance of health services institutions in Algeria, a field study in the hospital institution - Suleiman Amirat in M'sila, University of M'sila
- Rowley, Daniel James and Sherman, Herbert. (2007). From planning to change, implementing the plan at the level of higher education, translated by Yassin Kallas, Obeikan, pp. 60-62.
- Saleh, Othman bin Abdullah, (2012). Competitiveness of Higher Education Institutions: A Proposed Framework, *Al-Bahith Magazine*, Issue(10)
- Šimić, L. M., & Štimac, H. (2012). Competitiveness in higher education: A need for marketing orientation and service quality. *Economics and sociology*, 5, 23-34.

Tan, C. L., Goh, Y. N., & Chan, H. S. (2015). The determinants of competitiveness in quality: A study among the Malaysian private higher education institutions. *Problems and perspectives in management*, (13, Iss. 2 (spec. iss.)) , 371-379.